Considerations for ESSA’s Non-Academic Indicator

Bridging Research, Practice, and Policy

Friday, September 23, 2016
AYPF will be live-tweeting today’s event! We encourage you to join the conversation on Twitter.

#ESSA5thIndicator
@AYPF_Tweets
Social-Emotional Learning: The Basics

Stephanie M. Jones
Harvard University
jonesst@gse.harvard.edu
1. **What are the skills, actually?**
   They are more than willpower, grit, and perseverance.

2. **What do we know about their long-term impact?**
   **What works?**
   They play a central role in key life outcomes.

3. **What makes for effective practice?**
   Model, Teach, Practice, Discuss/Reflect…
What’s included?

- Knowledge, Skills, Dispositions in 3 Domains: Cognitive, Emotion, Social
- Considerations: Development, Context, Facilitating Factors
What do we know?
• Non-exp. studies link skills in childhood to life outcomes (e.g., self control, social competence)
• Exp. evaluations of programs show moderate effects on children and settings; larger effects for important groups

What’s common to effective practice?
• Safe, supportive, engaging context + opportunities to build skills
• Model, Teach, Practice, Discuss/Reflect
Research Trends

• Social emotional skills are influenced by many factors, such as age and reference group

• Many student SEL measures trend down “naturally” during certain age periods

• So direct student measures for school-level accountability can be problematic
Attitudes and Beliefs Aren’t Constant Over Time
An Alternative: School “Input” Measures or Indirect Student Measures

• We could measure “what teachers do” that is known to be positively related to SEL, or

• Measure students’ response to teacher or their environment, such as how supported they feel by teachers, how much of a sense of belonging they have at school, etc.*

*Student-level measures are influenced by many things
Supportive Staff-Youth Relationships are Critical

Among elementary, middle and high school youth, those who feel more supported and encouraged:

- Enjoy their activities more $[b=.25]$  
- Are more engaged $[b=0.45]$  
- Feel they learn more $[b=.45]$
How Students’ Rating of Their Environment is Related to:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Youth Ratings of:</th>
<th>Engagement</th>
<th>Perceived Learning</th>
<th>Enjoyment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive Adult Support</td>
<td>.25***</td>
<td>.45***</td>
<td>.25***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative Adult Interactions</td>
<td>.12*</td>
<td>0.06</td>
<td>-.17***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classroom Management Skills</td>
<td>.22***</td>
<td>.29***</td>
<td>.27***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperative Peer Learning</td>
<td>0.10</td>
<td>0.08</td>
<td>.14**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youth Input</td>
<td>.11*</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>.10*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Students of Different Ages Respond Differently

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive Adult Support</th>
<th>Engagement</th>
<th>Perceived Learning</th>
<th>Enjoyment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For Elementary School Students</td>
<td>-0.07</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>-0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For Middle and High School Students</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conditions for Learning and Development

David Osher
American Institutes for Research
Importance of Both Competencies and Conditions to Learning & Development

Teaching

Learning

Improved Capacity

Competencies

Conditions

@Education_AIR
ESSA5thIndicator
# Conditions For Learning, Engagement, and Wellbeing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Safety</th>
<th>Support, Care, &amp; Connection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Physically safe</td>
<td>- Meaningful connection to adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Emotionally safe</td>
<td>- Attachment with key adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Intellectually safe</td>
<td>- Experience of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Low Risk Environments</td>
<td>- Care &amp; Respect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Absence of micro-aggressions</td>
<td>- Inclusivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Cultural respect &amp; responsiveness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Positive peer relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Effective and available support</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Challenge &amp; Engagement</th>
<th>Peer and Adult Social Emotional Competency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- High expectations</td>
<td>- Understand &amp; Manage Emotions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Educational opportunities are connected to life goals</td>
<td>- Understand &amp; Manage Relationships</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Strong personal motivation</td>
<td>- Pro-social Values and Dispositions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Engaging Curricula</td>
<td>(Attitudes/Mindsets)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Robust opportunities to learn</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

@Education_AIR
#ESSA5thIndicator
Supporting Effective Social and Emotional Development & Wellbeing

Teacher Well-Being and Awareness

Effective Conditions for Learning

Social and Emotional Skill Development

Jennings & Greenberg, 2009
Opportunities for Continuous Improvement under ESSA:

Lessons from Out-of-School Time

Charles Smith, Ph.D.
David P. Weikart Center for Youth Program Quality
at the Forum for Youth Investment
Continuous Improvement Opportunities in the New Law

- Continuous improvement opportunities in the new law
- Building skills with adults and children
  - *Context* is important for skill growth
  - *Words* are important for adults and their organization
- Formative measurement
  - Granularity, behavior
  - Teacher practices
- Lower-stakes accountability
- *Afterschool programs* are designed to build SEL skills
A Deeper Look into Accountability under ESSA

Livia Lam
Learning Policy Institute
Pathways to New Accountability Through the Every Student Succeeds Act

Linda Darling-Hammond, Soung Bao, Channa M. Cook-Harvey, Livia Lam, Charmsino Mercer, Anne Podolsky, and Elizabeth Loisy Stosich

April 2016
ESSA: Required Indicators

- **Elementary and Middle Schools**
  - Test Scores
  - A “measure of student growth” or other academic indicator
  - English language proficiency
  - **At least one indicator of school quality or student success that allows for meaningful differentiation among student performance**

- **High Schools**
  - Test scores (may include student growth)
  - Four-year graduation rate (may include extended-year graduation rates)
  - English language proficiency
  - **At least one indicator of school quality or student success that allows for meaningful differentiation among student groups**
ESSA: School Quality or Student Success Indicator(s)

- Allows for meaningful differentiation in school performance
- Is valid, reliable, comparable, and statewide
- May include one or more measures of:
  - Student engagement
  - Educator engagement
  - Student access to and completion of advanced coursework
  - School climate and safety
  - Any other indicator the State chooses that meet the requirements
# Potential Indicators for a Multiple Measures System

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Academic Outcomes</th>
<th>Opportunities to Learn</th>
<th>Engagement / Responsiveness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Achievement on Assessments</td>
<td>Curriculum Access</td>
<td>Student Participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Standardized test results, reported in terms of status and growth for individual students and/or student cohorts</td>
<td>• Access to a full curriculum, including science, history, and the arts, as well as reading and math</td>
<td>• Attendance / chronic absenteeism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Performance assessment results from common state tasks</td>
<td>• Availability of and participation in rigorous courses (e.g. college preparatory, Advanced placement), programs, etc.</td>
<td>• Suspensions / expulsion rates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Progress toward English language proficiency / EL reclassification rates</td>
<td>• Availability of standards-based curriculum materials, technology resources</td>
<td>• Student perceptions of belonging, safety, engagement, school climate on student surveys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students meeting college standard on AP/IB or other college readiness tests or dual credit college coursework</td>
<td></td>
<td>Social-emotional learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Student attitudes towards learning (academic mindset)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graduation / School Progress</td>
<td>Access to Resources</td>
<td>Indicators of social-emotional skills (from assessments)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 4-, 5-, and 6-year adjusted cohort graduation rates</td>
<td>• Ratios of students, counselors, and specialists to students</td>
<td>Indicators of social-emotional supports (from surveys)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Teacher qualifications</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Safe, adequate facilities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Career and College Readiness</td>
<td>School Climate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Students completing college preparatory coursework, approved CTE sequence, or both</td>
<td>• Evidence from student and staff surveys about school offerings, instruction, supports, trust, belonging</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teachers’ Opportunities to Learn</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Access to and participation in professional development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Access to Resources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Ratios of students, counselors, and specialists to students</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Teacher qualifications</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Safe, adequate facilities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School Climate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Evidence from student and staff surveys about school offerings, instruction, supports, trust, belonging</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Teachers’ Opportunities to Learn</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Access to and participation in professional development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ESSA: Rethinking Accountability

• Strategies
  • Encourage a dashboard of indicators reflecting:
    • Student success
    • Engagement
    • Opportunities to learn
  • Require systems for continuous improvement
  • Require state/district attention to struggling schools and flexibility for evidence-based interventions
ESSA: Design Considerations

• What is the indicator’s purpose within the state accountability and improvement system?
  • School Identification (federal accountability purposes)
  • Diagnostic (not tied to school identification)
  • Continuous Improvement (weight and ratings)
• What is worth measuring?
  • Measurable: valid, reliable and stable over time
  • Actionable: schools can influence and impact the outcome
  • Meaningful: clearly connected to college and career readiness and the elimination of gaps

@LPI_Learning #ESSA5thIndicator
ESSA: Design Considerations

• Who should be at the table when designing systems and selecting indicators for continuous improvement for all students?
• What behavior at the state, district, school, and classroom level should these systems incentivize?
• Does the State’s accountability and improvement system allow for additional indicators as they are developed?
Moderated Questions

Caitlin Emma
Politico
Audience Q&A