The Intersection of Afterschool and Competency-Based Learning

Emerging Trends, Policy Considerations, and Questions for the Future

AYPF White Paper
January 2016
INTRODUCTION

In recent decades, the demand for a highly-skilled, globally competitive workforce has resulted in the need for all students to graduate high school prepared for college, careers, and beyond. Labor market projections from the Georgetown University Center on Education and the Workforce indicate that jobs that will require a postsecondary credential are forecasted to increase from 59 to 65 percent over the next decade.¹

To further the goal of ensuring all students are college and career ready, AYPF has been exploring the opportunities that exist at the intersection of afterschool and competency-based learning as a strategy to help students develop the knowledge, skills, abilities, and dispositions needed for success in postsecondary education, the workforce, and civic society. We believe that college and career readiness (CCR) is much more than academic preparation for postsecondary education or work:

> Readiness means being prepared to successfully complete credit-bearing college coursework or industry certification without remediation, having the academic skills and self-motivation necessary to persist and progress in postsecondary education, and having identified career goals and the necessary steps to achieve them. Readiness also requires the developmental maturity to thrive in the increasingly independent worlds of postsecondary education and careers, the cultural knowledge to understand the expectations of the college environment and labor market, and the employer-desired skills to succeed in an innovation-based economy.²

Developing this range of knowledge, skills, abilities, and dispositions in order to be successful is a big undertaking, and schools cannot do this work alone. In other words, CCR requires support and input from a variety of providers and programs, which often occurs outside of the traditional classroom.

AYPF has often cited afterschool as a critical partner to help contribute to a young person’s CCR.³ AYPF uses the term ‘afterschool’ to refer to the full range of programs and activities that are available to students beyond regular school hours. These include traditional afterschool and summer programs, as well as expanded learning opportunities (ELOs), which incorporate internships, independent study, and wraparound support services. Research has demonstrated that high-quality afterschool providers help contribute to a student’s CCR through college and career exploration, social and emotional learning, life skills development, including communication,

---

professionalism, teamwork, etc., various enrichment activities, and more. Afterschool programs help students foster academic and technical, 21st century, and social and emotional knowledge, skills, abilities, and dispositions deemed necessary for CCR by providing opportunities to apply knowledge in hands-on educational, work, and community service experiences.

In recent years, we have also seen the growth of competency-based learning (CBL), a student-centered strategy that helps students learn and progress towards graduation. Otherwise referred to as proficiency-based, mastery-based, outcome-based, performance-based, and standards-based education, instruction and learning, CBL is commonly understood to be a system of instruction, assessment, grading, and academic reporting based on student demonstration of mastery of learned knowledge and skills as they progress through their education. As a strategy to help students learn, CBL often focuses on the process of learning skills such as critical thinking, problem solving, and teamwork, as well as academic and technical content. CBL is also less reliant on seat-time and allows students to advance at their own pace to the next level or grade when they can demonstrate mastery of certain skills or competencies. When aligned with postsecondary education standards or employer-desired skills, CBL contributes to a student’s CCR by giving them engaging, learner-centered opportunities to develop and master important skills.

As students learn and develop valuable skills and competencies both in and out of school, it seems natural to explore strategies and policies to support the intersection, interaction, and interrelationship of these two learning venues and how they are using CBL. Afterschool programs have often embraced the principles of CBL, as they tend to engage students in personalized learning and encourage student ownership of their learning. CBL allows students the flexibility to demonstrate mastery at their own pace and in a variety of learning environments, often during out-of-school hours.

In the next section, we explore some emerging trends and promising practices from two the fields of afterschool and CBL that have demonstrated success in preparing students for college and careers.

**EMERGING TRENDS AND PROMISING PRACTICES**

By partnering with the K-12 education system, afterschool can help students develop and demonstrate mastery of certain skills and, in some cases, earn credit or credentials for some of those skills. While there are plenty of examples of partnerships between K-12 and afterschool, the idea of afterschool informing CBL and vice versa is an emerging concept. Based upon leading practices in the field, we have identified three trends at the intersection of afterschool and CBL.

---


5 For more information on CBL, see [http://www.competencyworks.org/about/competency-education/](http://www.competencyworks.org/about/competency-education/).

related to CCR. They are Understanding and Defining Competencies; Competencies as Currency for Course Credit; and Badges as Translators of Competencies. Below, we explain these trends and provide descriptions of programs and partnerships embodying these trends.

Understanding and Defining Competencies

Many afterschool programs help students develop skills such as communication, teamwork, critical thinking, and self-advocacy and have intentionally focused on how youth acquire and demonstrate mastery of these skills. For example, some afterschool programs have identified specific employer-desired skills and competencies that are critical for CCR and have focused on the definition and measurement of those competencies in ways that are transparent and clear for program providers, employers, and students. We think the work that afterschool practitioners have done to create student-centered learning experiences focused on the development of skills could also be an opportunity for collaboration with K-12 educators. Perhaps the work of afterschool practitioners in defining and measuring skills could inform K-12 educators and lead to joint work on articulating and measuring these life skills, either as independent competencies or within a range of course competencies. Below are examples of two programs that are intentional and transparent about the development of CCR competencies.

Urban Alliance

Urban Alliance is a community-based afterschool program that prepares high school students for postsecondary education and careers. Urban Alliance provides paid internships to high school seniors who are paired with a mentor in a professional setting. Serving roughly 2,000 students with 200 employer partners in Washington, D.C., Baltimore, Chicago, and Northern Virginia, Urban Alliance’s High School Internship Program provides participating students with job skills training, alumni support, job placement, post-high school coaching, and career mentorship. Given the hands-on, real-world nature of the internship experience, by the end of the ten-month program, students increase proficiency in professional work skills; gain work experience; graduate from high school; solidify a postsecondary plan; and internalize a strategy for identifying and sustaining employment. With 90 percent of alumni having enrolled in college and 80 percent of alumni having persisted through college, Urban Alliance plays an important role in preparing students to be college and career ready through developing skills such as written and verbal communication, workplace professionalism, and teamwork.

Given Urban Alliance’s long history of working directly with employers to define skill competencies necessary for students participating students in their internships, we believe there is an opportunity for afterschool providers like Urban Alliance to share their knowledge with K-12 educators. More specifically, Urban Alliance has developed a number of workshops and tools to use with their participants to ensure they gain certain skills in advance of and during their workplace experiences.

“These employment opportunities are learning opportunities—they help students connect the dots between what’s happening in the classroom in the real world.” - Daniel Tsin, Urban Alliance

7 http://www.theurbanalliance.org/about/programs/high-school-internship-program
While this example focuses on the development of employer-desired skills, we believe the expertise of afterschool providers in developing student-centered learning experiences for skill attainment can be valuable to K-12 educators looking to create similar student-centered learning experiences around academic and technical content.

**After School Matters, Chicago**

*After School Matters (ASM)* is a nonprofit organization that provides afterschool and summer learning opportunities to youth in Chicago. ASM offers paid internships and apprenticeships in the arts, communications, science, sports, and technology to more than 15,000 teens each year, 70 percent of whom come from the 39 lowest-income communities in Chicago. ASM partners with the Chicago Public Schools, Chicago Park District, Chicago Public Library, Chicago Department of Family and Support Services, Chicago Department of Cultural Affairs and Special Events, and a network of nearly 200 community-based organizations throughout the city to provide greater opportunities and services to teens. In addition to the skills acquired in a particular content area, ASM programs provide students with important skills like personal mindset, planning for success, social awareness, verbal communication, collaboration, and problem solving that are critical for CCR. Moreover, the skills and experiences students acquire through participation in ASM have translated into gains in the classroom. Students who participate in ASM miss fewer days of school, tend to fail fewer core academic courses (English, Math, Science, and Social Studies), graduate at higher rates, and drop out at lower rates than similar students who do not participate in the program.

Through the creation of student-centered experiences in internships and apprenticeships, ASM demonstrates that both the content area and skill competencies can be developed through participating in activities outside of the classroom. More importantly, the team at ASM has worked to define exactly the skills and abilities their participants are gaining. This information could be valuable to K-12 educators as they move towards understanding how non-traditional classroom experiences can provide opportunities to demonstrate mastery of academic skills.

**Competencies as Currency for Course Credit**

Competencies can serve as a language or currency for translating learning experiences to credit-bearing experiences for students. The most direct intersection of afterschool and CBL is when afterschool programs provide competency-based experiences that lead to academic credit. Building the infrastructure in school districts to support this type of partnership has been extremely challenging, and some efforts have been attempted, but most have not been sustainable. While this trend may offer the most promising interrelationship of CBL and afterschool, it is difficult work, and many policy and instructional issues need greater attention, as we discuss in our “Considerations Moving Forward” section. Here we highlight two examples of afterschool programs partnering with K-12 educators in the awarding of credits for competencies.

---


Providence After School Alliance

The Providence After School Alliance (PASA) aims to improve and increase high-quality after-school opportunities for children and youth in Providence, Rhode Island and uses CBL strategies to make connections between the community and schools, through academic content, collaborative teaching practices, and real-world, hands-on learning experiences. Their AfterZone program serves more than 1,000 middle school youth a year through five school-centered, community “campuses” that provide a variety of programs in the areas of the arts, sports, science, and life skills. Another PASA program, The Hub, allows high school students to receive elective credits through work done with community-based organizations in partnership with PASA.10 Activities include video game development, Android App design and development, debate, and environmental science. These activities are mapped to standards and other required course competencies through collaboration with the community-based afterschool provider and a supervising high school teacher. Students’ experiences in afterschool programs are directly linked to course standards, and assessments of their competencies include participation in competitions or final performances.

Building the capacity to offer course credit for afterschool experiences coordinated through the Hub required a significant amount of work by the staff at PASA. Although Rhode Island state policy provided the flexibility to offer credit for experiences outside of school, it took time and effort to build a trusting relationship between PASA and Providence Public Schools to pilot afterschool experiences for course credit. The initial pilot effort focused on elective courses, and afterschool providers worked closely with high school elective teachers to align afterschool programs with course standards and create culminating performance assessments for students to demonstrate their mastery of competencies. Since The Hub’s inception in 2012, over 450 students have enrolled, and over 200 students have received course credits for this out-of-school time learning.

New Hampshire ELOs

In 2008, New Hampshire eliminated the traditional Carnegie Unit, “seat-time” model and mandated the use of proficiency-based diplomas. This has opened up the opportunity for Extended Learning Opportunities (ELOs) to help students attain credit, and now many districts and schools allow students to participate in ELOs. ELOs are a means by which students can acquire knowledge and skills outside of the traditional classroom, through participation in afterschool programs, apprenticeships, community service, independent study, online courses, internships, performing groups, and private instruction. The majority of high schools in New Hampshire are providing ELOs, and many have a full-time or part-time ELO coordinator to help students navigate and coordinate the possibilities afforded through ELOs. The coordinator also serves an important role working with the community-based providers and classroom teachers to clarify the course competencies and ensure students have demonstrated mastery in a way that meets the school’s standards.

---

10 To learn more, please see this AYPF webinar [http://www.aypf.org/resources/high-school-for-credit-expanded-learning-opportunities-in-providence-rhode-island/](http://www.aypf.org/resources/high-school-for-credit-expanded-learning-opportunities-in-providence-rhode-island/)
In New Hampshire, ELOs have been helpful in providing greater flexibility on where, when, and how students learn and earn credit. For students struggling to master certain courses or specific competencies within a course, ELOs have provided an opportunity to demonstrate mastery of competencies within an activity of personal interest, rather than the traditional classroom setting. Similarly, for students who have gotten off track to graduation, participating in an ELO can allow them to catch up to their peers by engaging in activities that are more relevant to them. According to recent research, this flexibility has helped erase the high school graduation gap between economically disadvantaged and more advantaged students. In addition, students who participated in ELOs had higher GPAs, were more likely to take college admissions exams, and had higher SAT scores compared to students that did not participate in ELOs.

**Badges as Translator of Competencies**

Participation in afterschool programs can help students develop and demonstrate mastery of skills and lead to earning badges or other certifications. These badges and certifications may not yet be accepted by the K-12 education system, but they may have value to employers, higher education institutions, and other organizations. Digital badges, in particular, are a useful way to link formal and informal learning and may be viewed by youth as a valuable credential that reflects their individual interests, skills, and achievements. Projects in Oregon and Kansas provide examples of experimentation with badging in the afterschool hours.

**OregonASK Digital Badge Pilot**

Since 2007, Oregon's "Credit Option" policy has allowed students to earn credit in school, outside of school, and retroactively through demonstrating prior learning. Overall, the policy has been underutilized in Oregon, but has proven useful for the Oregon FIRST robotics program, where students are able to receive elective credit for participating in the out-of-school competition club. In addition to issuing credit, OregonASK has also recently begun experimenting with digital badges, particularly for middle school students in rural areas. Following an initial meeting in 2014, work groups of afterschool providers, community stakeholders, and issuing partners convened to discuss, develop, and design badge projects. Ten organizations submitted proposals, and seven completed their pilot projects and issued a total of 350 badges. This process warranted important insights into the badging process: programs must offer meaningful learning experiences to students, badges themselves must be well-designed with clear processes for issuing them, and a long-lasting online infrastructure is needed to hold badges as long as students want to use them. Oregon is still in the early stages of digital badging, but represents the emerging trend of utilizing badges as a mode of recognizing competencies that have been developed in the non-school hours.

---


Organized by the Kansas Enrichment Network, EPIC is a pilot project taking place in two rural communities with 40 middle school students participating from each community. The project focuses on measuring employer-recognized competencies of employability and technical skills in the following program areas of choice: culinary arts, manufacturing, construction, and medical sciences. Participating students gain field learning experience, and through a partnership with a local afterschool provider, are writing and reflecting on their successes, challenges, and things they could have done differently throughout the year. As they progress, students earn digital badges connected to competencies that are aligned with Kansas's Rose Standards, Next Generation Science Standards, and P21 learning standards. In addition to badges, afterschool providers are hoping to be able to provide the participating middle school students with half of an elective credit going into high school. With the goal of fostering the range of possible pathways for students through school and into the workforce, the project targets students identified as at-risk of dropping out or those who do not officially drop out, but are only minimally engaged in learning.

CONSIDERATIONS Moving Forward

We recognize there are opportunities for the fields of afterschool and CBL to develop independently, but we believe bringing them together presents a unique opportunity for these two fields to learn from each other and better serve students, especially in preparing students for success in college and careers. As the work in this area is still nascent and many questions remain, we have identified several challenges that afterschool practitioners and K-12 educators implementing CBL face. One is related to language use; another to the policy environment that allows this work to take place, and a third to the challenges in developing and promoting cross-sector coordination. We also comment on the ever-present challenge of the interplay between practice and policy in helping bring these ideas to scale.

Lack of Clarity with Field-Specific Language

As demonstrated by the sheer range of terms used to encompass both afterschool and CBL, it is evident that language presents a challenge as we work to build common understanding and seek opportunities for collaboration and coordination among these two fields. While each field independently presents its own nomenclature challenges on what certain terms mean and in what context, language can also be an entry point for practitioners and educators operating in both arenas to collaborate around a process of articulating and defining competencies, especially ones that focus on the development of college and career ready skills. For example, afterschool is often cited as a learning environment to help students develop CCR skills such as problem-solving, conflict resolution, self-control, leadership, responsible decision-making, and enhancement of self-efficacy and self-esteem. Given efforts to identify, define, and begin to measure this type of skill
development in afterschool programs, there is a unique opportunity for afterschool practitioners to work with K-12 educators around the development of competencies that merge academic content knowledge, technical skills, and personal skills.

In New Hampshire, ELO coordinators are beginning to assist students with these types of opportunities by creating avenues to demonstrate mastery of course competencies in out-of-school time. ELO coordinators facilitate understanding between the teacher of the course for which a student is attempting to earn credit or master a competency and the ELO provider. Even though the competencies have already been defined, the partnership provides an opportunity for both the teacher and ELO provider to discuss how a student will achieve and demonstrate mastery of certain competencies.

It is important to note that within the conversation of language, there is a schism within the field of CBL. Are life-long learning skills or habits of minds such as creativity, problem-solving, and critical thinking a unique set of competencies unto themselves, or are they part of competencies for academic courses?\(^\text{13}\)

**Policy Environments to Support CBL and Afterschool**

In order to allow for learning to take place outside of a traditional classroom, there must be policy in place at both the state and district level. Currently, 43 states have policies in place to afford some iteration of CBL.\(^\text{14}\) While this seems to be a necessary first step, it appears to be both underused and misunderstood. For example, Oregon’s state board adopted policy in 2002 to allow for flexibility, but many districts do not know about it or understand how to effectively utilize it, nor do districts consider involving afterschool providers.\(^\text{15}\) At the other end of the spectrum, New Hampshire has defined the requirements for high school graduation through demonstrated mastery of competencies across the state, but gives districts the flexibility to “develop local policies that identify how the district shall engage students in creating, and support extended learning opportunities that occur outside of the physical school building and outside of the usual school day in which students demonstrate achievement as well as other educational experiences and instructional activities required by Ed 306.”\(^\text{16}\)

Additionally, often a policy related to CBL does not specify whether or not providers beyond the school can participate in the demonstration of mastery, which leads to confusion and challenges around transcription of credit and teacher of record policies. For CBL experiences that occur beyond the traditional school day in which a student is earning high school credit, there is a need for clear policy around the logistics of issuing the credit. Consideration must be paid to clarifying

\(^{15}\) [http://www.ode.state.or.us/teachlearn/standards/creditforproficiency/cfguidelines2009.pdf](http://www.ode.state.or.us/teachlearn/standards/creditforproficiency/cfguidelines2009.pdf)  
who is allowed to be the teacher of record, especially for accountability reasons. This is important because the teacher of record plays a critical role in transcripting credit through assigning the appropriate course from the catalogue, ensuring course standards and competencies are met, and validating the assessment. For this reason, more clarity on how afterschool providers can participate in CBL would be useful.

With a limited number of examples in which students are earning credit through out-of-school time experiences, there is still much to learn and work out with regard to issuing credit. While New Hampshire’s state policy provides the framework to allow for the intersection of CBL through afterschool providers, district policy is a necessary enabler to build the connection between CBL and afterschool. In order to pursue the promise of anytime, anywhere learning afforded by CBL and afterschool collaboration, districts have to commit resources and/or reorganize the responsibilities of staff to manage the day-to-day operations of these student-driven experiences. As mentioned previously, in New Hampshire, many districts and schools have an ELO Coordinator. This staff member is dedicated to handling the logistics of these experiences and serving as a critical liaison between the school and afterschool provider. The responsibility does not lie exclusively with the district; afterschool providers, too, must commit resources and work collaboratively with school administration and classroom teachers to monitor student experiences.

**Cross-Sector Coordination and Building Partnerships**

Cross-sector coordination between afterschool programs and schools existed well before we began exploring the intersection of afterschool and CBL, as there is a long history of afterschool providers being viewed as critical partners to achieving academic goals. For example, there are various models of extended school days taking advantage of afterschool providers to supplement academic instruction of classroom teachers through seamless integration of afterschool activities. But we must also consider other cross-agency coordination that is necessary in promoting collaboration between afterschool and CBL specifically.

One trend that occurs during afterschool hours is the provision of work-based learning experiences through job shadowing or internships. Depending on the types of jobs and age of students, the State Department of Labor might need to be involved as a partner to ensure that children are safe and businesses are meeting occupation and employability rules. In Kansas and New Hampshire for example, the State Department of Labor has been a critical partner in navigating insurance needs and other aspects of students who are under the age of 18 on a job site. In addition, the Department of Labor can be helpful in identifying which companies are in compliance with standards and regulations and those that are not, in order to protect both the student and the school partnership.

Additionally, as we look at afterschool and CBL as a strategy to better promote CCR, we must also consider postsecondary education as a potential partner and cross-agency collaborator. Given the lack of understanding of K-12 competency-based transcripts by institutions of higher education, there is the potential for afterschool to serve as an intermediary and translator. In other words,

---

17 To learn more about the expanded learning time model, see [http://www.timeandlearning.org/time-collaborative](http://www.timeandlearning.org/time-collaborative)
afterschool providers can help schools better articulate what skills and competencies students gain through competency-based experiences and help higher education institutions better understand their value, especially when recognizing credit is involved.

*Policy to Practice v. Practice to Policy: Which Comes First?*

Pursuing policy and practice simultaneously are both necessary ingredients for opportunity and innovation. However, given that interrelationships between afterschool and CBL are still emerging and best practices still developing, there are questions of whether or not we can continue to move forward without significant policy changes. Similar to the classic chicken or egg debate of which came first, we must consider if policy is the right lever to use, or if we should focus on developing and refining practice.

While this might not be a question with an easy answer, voices from the field offered some unique perspectives and considerations:

“Practitioners often don’t care what the policies are, but they care about what other practitioners are doing.” -Joe DiMartino, Center for Secondary School Redesign

“Just because practitioners don’t always know about the policies doesn’t mean the policies don’t make a difference. But, to make the biggest difference, the policies need to be known.” -Maria Worthem, iNACOL

Based on our experience, policy and practice need to advance together and constantly inform each other to ensure the most effective solutions.

**CONCLUSION**

Moving forward, there is still much to learn and consider, but it is clear that afterschool and CBL have a great deal to offer each other by learning from and working with each other. As we continue to pursue practices and policies to ensure all students are ready for college and careers, it is clear that the intersection, interaction, and interrelationship of afterschool and CBL provides an opportunity to better support CCR of more students.
Acknowledgments

This white paper was made possible with the assistance and insight of many leaders in afterschool/expanded learning and competency-based learning/education that honestly shared their experiences, perspectives, and challenges either by phone, in person, or through participating in the following AYPF events:

- **Increasing College and Career Readiness through Afterschool and Competency-Based Learning** (December 14, 2015)
- **The Intersection of Afterschool and Competency-Based Education** (October 1, 2015)
- **District and State Considerations for Incorporating Expanded Learning into Competency-Based Systems** (July 31, 2014)
- **Promoting Partnerships Between K-12 and Expanded Learning through Competency-based Approaches** (June 12, 2014)
- **The Role of Expanded Learning Opportunities in Competency-Based Education Systems** (September 24, 2013)
- **High School Credit for Expanded Learning Opportunities in Providence, Rhode Island** (July 23, 2013)
- **Promising Practices and Considerations for Districts in Competency-Based Education** (July 16, 2013)
- **Exploring Implications for State Policy in Competency-Based Education** (June 23, 2013)

We also wish to express gratitude to the AYPF staff that contributed to this work: Jennifer Brown Lerner, Deputy Director; Jenna Tomasello, Program Associate; Betsy Brand, Executive Director; and George Knowles, Digital Communications Associate.

Lastly, we would like to thank the Charles S. Mott Foundation for their generous support of this project and AYPF.